CHARLOTTE FIREFIGHTERS' RETIREMENT SYSTEM REPORT OF ACTUARY ON THE VALUATION PREPARED AS OF JULY 1, 2002

ANG REAL PROPERTY OF

sign shrink

and sources and

S920777

in more than the

meet.

-

o Sastanani---



A Mellon Consulting Company

200 Galleria Parkway, N.W. Suite 1900 Atlanta, Georgia 30339-5945

October 18, 2002

Board of Trustees Charlotte Firefighters' Retirement System 428 East Fourth Street Suite 205 Charlotte, NC 28202

Dear Members of the Board:

We are pleased to submit herewith the results of the annual actuarial valuation of the City of Charlotte Firefighters' Retirement System prepared as of July 1, 2002. The purpose of this report is to provide a summary of the funded status of the System as of July 1, 2002, to recommend rates of contribution and to provide accounting information under Governmental Accounting Standards Board Statements No. 25 and 27 (GASB 25 and 27). While not verifying the data at source, the actuary performed tests for consistency and reasonability.

The promised benefits of the System are included in the actuarially calculated contribution rates which are developed using the entry age normal cost method. Actuarial value of plan assets is used for actuarial valuation purposes. Gains and losses are reflected in the unfunded accrued liability that is being amortized by regular annual contributions as a level percentage of payroll within a 33-year period, on the assumption that payroll will increase by 3.75% annually. Due to recent asset losses and an amortization period that already exceeds 30 years, it is likely that the next valuation, as of June 30 2002, will indicate that an employer contribution above 12.65% will be required under GASB. The assumptions recommended by the actuary and adopted by the Board are in the aggregate reasonably related to the experience under the System and to reasonable expectations of anticipated experience under the System.

The valuation has been prepared in accordance with the parameters set forth in Statement Nos. 25 and 27 of the Governmental Accounting Standards Board. The annual required contribution (ARC) of the City under GASB for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2002 is 12.65% of payroll, which will liquidate the unfunded accrued liability over a 33-year period.

We have prepared the Schedule of Active Member Valuation Data, Schedule of Retirants and Beneficiaries Added to and Removed from Rolls, the Solvency Test and the Analysis of Financial Experience for the actuarial section of the Annual Report and the Schedule of Funding Progress and Trend Information for the financial section of the Annual Report.

This is to certify that the independent consulting actuary is a member of the American Academy of Actuaries and has experience in performing valuations for public retirement systems, that the valuation was prepared in accordance with principles of practice prescribed by the Actuarial Standards Board, and that the actuarial calculations were performed by qualified actuaries in accordance with accepted actuarial procedures, based on the current provisions of the retirement system and on actuarial assumptions that are internally consistent and reasonably based on the actual experience of the System.

In our opinion the System is operating on an actuarially sound basis. Assuming that contributions to the System are made by the City from year to year in the future at the rates recommended on the basis of the successive actuarial valuations, the continued sufficiency of the retirement fund to provide the benefits called for under the System may be safely anticipated.

We trust that the report will meet the approval of the Board and will furnish the desired information concerning the financial condition of the Retirement System.

The Table of Contents, which immediately follows, outlines the material contained in the report.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward A. Macdonald, ASA, MAAA, FCA Principal, Consulting Actuary

Tucot

Catherine G. Turcot Senior Consultant, Actuary

EAM/CGT:sr

TABLE OF CONTENTS

•

Í

0¹ 1000

- Alter

2. 1.

-contrainting

-

-

| Section | ltem | <u>Page No.</u> |
|----------|---|-----------------|
| 1 | Summary of Principal Results | 1 |
| 11 | Membership Data | 2 |
| 10 | Assets | 3 |
| IV | Comments on Valuation | 3 |
| V | Contributions Payable | 4 |
| VI | Accounting Information | 5 |
| VII | Experience | 8 |
| Schedule | | |
| Α | Development of the Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability | 9 |

| ^ | Development of the Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability | 9 |
|---|---|----|
| В | Valuation Balance Sheet and Solvency Test | 10 |
| С | Development of the Actuarial Value of Assets | 12 |
| D | Asset Information | 13 |
| Е | Outline of Actuarial Assumptions and Methods | 14 |
| F | Actuarial Cost Method | 16 |
| G | Summary of Main System Provisions as Interpreted | |
| | for Valuation Purposes | 17 |
| H | Tables of Membership Data | 19 |

CHARLOTTE FIREFIGHTERS' RETIREMENT SYSTEM REPORT OF ACTUARY ON THE VALUATION PREPARED AS OF JULY 1, 2002

SECTION I - SUMMARY OF PRINCIPAL RESULTS

1. For convenience of reference, the principal results of the current and preceding valuations are summarized below.

Valuation Date July 1, 2002 July 1, 2001 Number of active members 856 853 Annualized compensation \$ 39,848,691 \$ 38,079,024 Retired members and beneficiaries: Number 411 389 Annual allowances 13,754,421 \$ \$ 12,824,893 Number of terminated vested members 2 2 Assets: Market Value \$ 224,011,606 \$ 239,904,885 Actuarial Value 254,012,864 246.613.781 Unfunded actuarial accrued liability 11,699,052 \$ \$ 8,152,804 Amortization Period 33 years 19 years **Fiscal Year Ending** June 30, 2003 June 30, 2002 City annual required contribution rate (ARC): Normal (including expenses of 0.75%) 11.21% 11.11% Accrued liability 1.44 1.54 Total 12.65% 12.65% Member contribution rate 12.65% 12.65%

- The major benefit and contribution provisions of the System as reflected in the valuation are summarized in Schedule G. There have been no change since the previous valuation.
- 3. Schedule E of this report outlines the full set of actuarial assumptions and methods used in the valuation. There have been no changes since the previous valuation.
- The entry age actuarial cost method was used to prepare the valuation. Schedule F contains a brief description of the actuarial cost method.
- 5. Comments on the valuation results as of July 1, 2002 are given in Section IV and further discussion of the contributions is set out in Section V.

SECTION II - MEMBERSHIP DATA

- Data regarding the membership of the System for use as a basis of the valuation were furnished by the Retirement System office. The valuation included 856 active members with annualized compensation totaling \$39,848,691.
- The following table shows the number of retired members and beneficiaries as of July 1, 2002 together with the amount of their annual retirement benefits payable under the System as of that date.

| GROUP | NUMBER* | ANNUAL RETIREMENT BENEFITS |
|-----------------------------------|---------|-------------------------------|
| Service Retirements | 335 | \$ 12,187,746 |
| Disability Retirements | 61 | 1,344,616 |
| Beneficiaries of Deceased Members | 15 | <u>222,059</u> |
| Total | 411 | \$ 13,754,421 |

THE NUMBER AND ANNUAL BENEFITS OF RETIRED MEMBERS AND BENEFICIARIES AS OF JULY 1, 2002

In addition, there are two terminated members entitled to deferred vested benefits.

3.

Table 1 of Schedule H shows the distribution by age and years of membership service of the number of active members included in the valuation, while Table 2 shows the number and annual benefits of retired members and beneficiaries included in the valuation, distributed by age. Table 3 shows the schedule of active member valuation data and Table 4 shows the schedule of retirants and beneficiaries added to and removed from the rolls.

SECTION III - ASSETS

As of July 1, 2002, the total market value of assets amounted to \$224,011,606. The actuarial value of assets used for the current valuation was \$254,012,864. Schedule C shows the development of the actuarial value of assets as of July 1, 2002. Schedule D shows the allocation of the System's assets and the market value of assets for three years.

SECTION IV - COMMENTS ON VALUATION

- Schedule B of this report contains the valuation balance sheet which shows the present and prospective assets and liabilities of the System as of July 1, 2002. The valuation was prepared in accordance with the actuarial assumptions set forth in Schedule E and the actuarial cost method which is described in Schedule F.
- 2. The valuation balance sheet shows that the System has total prospective liabilities of \$367,248,775 of which \$130,540,248 is for the prospective benefits payable on account of present retired members, beneficiaries of deceased members, and terminated members entitled to deferred benefits, and \$236,708,527 is for the prospective benefits payable on account of present active members. Against these liabilities, the System has a total present actuarial value of assets of \$254,012,864 as of July 1, 2002. The difference of \$113,235,911 between the total liabilities and the total present assets represents the present value of future contributions.
- 3. The contributions to the System consist of normal contributions and accrued liability contributions. The valuation indicates that normal contributions at the rate of 23.11% of payroll are required under the entry age method. Of this amount, 12.65% is paid by the members and the remaining 10.46% is required by the City.
- 4. Prospective normal contributions at the rate of 23.11% have a present value of \$101,536,859. When this amount is subtracted from \$113,235,911 is the present value of the total future contributions to be made, there remains \$11,699,052 as the amount of unfunded accrued liability contributions. The development of the unfunded accrued liability is shown in Schedule A.

SECTION V - CONTRIBUTIONS PAYABLE

- 1. The contributions consist of a normal contribution and an accrued liability contribution as determined by actuarial valuation.
- 2. The normal contribution rate is calculated as the level percentage of payroll which, if applied for the average new member during the entire period of his anticipated covered service, would be required to meet the cost of all benefits payable on his behalf. On the basis of the valuation the normal contribution rate was determined to be 23.11%.
- 3. Section 24 of Title V of the Charlotte Firefighters' Retirement System Act states that each member shall contribute an amount equal to the Member's Compensation multiplied by 12.65%.
- The City normal contribution rate is equal to the difference between the normal contribution rate of 23.11% and the member contribution rate of 12.65%, or 10.46% of payroll. An additional 0.75% is required for expenses, making the total City normal rate 11.21% of payroll.
- Section 25 of Title V of the Charlotte Firefighters Retirement System Act states that the City of Charlotte shall contribute an amount equal to the Member's Compensation multiplied by 12.65%.
- 6. Based on a total employer rate of 12.65%, the annual accrued liability contribution rate is determined to be 1.44% of payroll. This rate will be sufficient to amortize the unfunded actuarial accrued liability within approximately 33 years following the valuation date, on the assumption that the payroll will increase 3.75% each year.

The following table summarizes the employer contributions which were determined by the July 1,
 2002 valuation and are recommended for use.

| CONTRIBUTION | PERCENTAGE OF ACTIVE MEMBERS' COMPENSATION |
|---|--|
| Normal (including expenses of 0.75%) | 11.21% |
| Accrued Liability | <u> 1.44 </u> |
| Total | 12.65% |

CITY ANNUAL REQUIRED CONTRIBUTIONS (ARC) FOR FISCAL YEAR ENDING JUNE 30, 2003

SECTION VI - ACCOUNTING INFORMATION

1.

Governmental Accounting Standards Board Statements 25 and 27 set forth certain items of required supplementary information to be disclosed in the financial statements of the System and the employer. One such item is a distribution of the number of employees by type of membership, as follows:

NUMBER OF ACTIVE AND RETIRED PARTICIPANTS AS OF JULY 1, 2002

| GROUP | NUMBER |
|---|------------|
| Retired participants and beneficiaries currently receiving benefits | 411 |
| Terminated participants and beneficiaries entitled to benefits but not yet receiving | |
| benefits | 2 |
| Active Participants | <u>856</u> |
| Total | 1,269 |

Another such item is the schedule of funding progress as shown below.

| Actuarial Valuation <u>Date</u> | Actuarial Value of Assets <u>(a)</u> | Accrued Liability (AAL) Entry Age <u>(b)</u> | Unfunded AAL (UAAL) <u>(b-a)</u> | Funded Ratio <u>(a / b)</u> | Covered Payroll <u>(c)</u> | Percentage of Covered Payroll <u>((b-a)/c)</u> |
|---------------------------------------|---|---|---|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------|---|
| 7/1/97 | \$161,731 | \$168,146 | \$ 6,415 | 96.2% | \$26,922 | 23.8% |
| 7/1/98 | 187,387 | 179,351 | (8,036) | 104.5 | 28,964 | (27.7) |
| 7/1/99 | 216,336 | 186,854 | (29,482) | 115.8 | 32,462 | (90.8) |
| 7/1/00* | 235,901 | 239,784 | 3,883 | 98.4 | 33,080 | 11.7 |
| 7/1/01 | 246,614 | 254,767 | 8,153 | 96.8 | 38,079 | 21.4 |
| 7/1/02 | 254,013 | 265,712 | 11,699 | 95.6 | 39,849 | 29.4 |

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS **Dollar Amounts in Thousands**

All figures prior to 7/1/99 are from July 1, 1998 actuarial valuation report prepared by the prior actuary.

- * Economic and demographic assumptions were changed as of July 1, 2000 due to an experience review. In addition, the asset valuation method was changed.
- З. Following is the calculation of the annual pension cost and net pension obligation for the fiscal

year ending June 30, 2002.

Annual Pension Cost and Net Pension Obligation for Fiscal Year Ending 6/30/02

| (a) | Employer annual required contribution | \$ | 5,062,000 |
|-----|--|----------|-------------|
| (b) | Interest on net pension obligation | | (530,000) |
| (c) | Adjustment to annual required contribution | <u> </u> | 492,000 |
| (d) | Annual pension cost (a) + (b) + (c) | \$ | 5,024,000 |
| (e) | Employer contributions made for fiscal year ending 6/30/02 | | 5,062,000 |
| (f) | Increase (decrease) in net pension obligation (d) – (e) | \$ | (38,000) |
| (g) | Net pension obligation beginning of fiscal year | | (6,845,000) |
| (ĥ) | Net pension obligation end of fiscal year (f) + (g) | \$ | (6,883,000) |

TREND INFORMATION **Dollar Amounts in Thousands**

| Year Ending | Annual Pension Cost <u>(APC)</u> | Percentage Of APC <u>Contributed</u> | Net Pension Obligation <u>(NPO)</u> |
|----------------|--|--|--|
| June 30, 2000 | \$ (15) | N/A | \$(7,848) |
| June 30, 2001 | 5,540 | 81.9% | (6,845) |
| June 30, 2002 | 5,024 | 100.8 | (6,883) |

2.

4. The annual required contribution (ARC) as a percentage of payroll, determined in accordance with the parameters of GASB 25/27, is shown below.

2002/2003 FISCAL YEAR EMPLOYER ANNUAL REQUIRED CONTRIBUTION (ARC) BASED ON THE VALUATION AS OF JULY 1, 2002

| EMPLOYER ANNUAL REQUIRED CONTRIBUTION (ARC) | | |
|---|----------------|--|
| 11.21% <u>1.44</u> 12.65% | | |
| | 11.21% 1.44 | |

5. Additional information as of July 1, 2002 follows.

Solid Andress

A STREET

| Valuation date | 7/1/02 |
|--------------------------------|------------------------|
| Actuarial cost method | Entry age |
| Amortization method | Level dollar open |
| Remaining amortization period | 33 years |
| Asset valuation method | 5-year smoothed market |
| Actuarial assumptions: | |
| Investment rate of return* | 7.75% |
| Projected salary increases* | 4.75-7.75% |
| *Includes inflation at | 3.75% |
| Cost-of-living adjustments | N/A |

SECTION VII – EXPERIENCE

1. As an aid to the Board in adopting service and mortality tables, the actuary prepared an experience investigation for the five-year period ending June 30, 1999. The valuation was based on the assumptions adopted by the Board at the April 27, 2000 Board meeting as a result of that investigation.

The following table shows the estimated change in the unfunded accrued liability from various factors that resulted in an increase of \$3,546,000 in the unfunded accrued liability from \$8,153,000 to \$11,699,000 during the fiscal year ending July 1, 2002.

ANALYSIS OF FINANCIAL EXPERIENCE - CHANGE IN UNFUNDED ACCRUED LIABILITY (in thousands of dollars)

| ltem | Amount of Increase/ (Decrease) |
|--|-----------------------------------|
| Interest (7.75%) added to previous | |
| unfunded accrued liability | 631.8 |
| Accrued Liability Contribution | (616.2) |
| Recognized Asset Loss | 7,500.3 |
| Liability (Gain)/ Loss | (2,552.6) |
| Salary Increases | (1,417.3) |
| Amendments | 0 |
| Asset Method Change | n n |
| Assumption Changes | 0 |
| Increase In Unfunded Accrued Liability | 3,546.0 |

SCHEDULE A

1 (ogganzálo)

DEVELOPMENT OF THE UNFUNDED ACTUARIAL ACCRUED LIABILITY AS OF JULY 1, 2002

| (1) | Prese | nt value of prospective benefits: | | |
|-----|--------|--|------|-------------|
| | (a) | Present active members | \$ | 236,708,527 |
| | (c) | Present retired members, beneficiaries and former members entitled to deferred | | |
| | | vested benefits | - | 130,540,248 |
| | (c) | Total | . \$ | 367,248,775 |
| (2) | Preser | t value of future System and member normal contributions | | |
| | before | expenses | · _ | 101,536,859 |
| (3) | Actuar | ial accrued liabilities 1(c) – (2) | \$ | 265,711,916 |
| (4) | Actuar | ial value of assets | _ | 254,012,864 |
| (5) | Unfund | ed actuarial accrued liability (3) – (4) | \$ | 11,699,052 |

SCHEDULE B - VALUATION BALANCE SHEET AND SOLVENCY TEST

VALUATION BALANCE SHEET

RESULTS OF THE VALUATION AS OF JULY 1, 2002 SHOWING THE PRESENT AND PROSPECTIVE ASSETS AND LIABILITIES OF THE CHARLOTTE FIREFIGHTERS' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

| ACTUARIAL LIABILITIES | | | | | | |
|--|--------------|-------------|--------------------|--|--|--|
| Present value of prospective benefits payable on account of present retired members, beneficiaries of deceased members, and terminated members entitled to deferred benefits \$ 130,540,2 | | | | | | |
| Present value of prospective benefits payable on account of present active members | <u>\$</u> | 236,708,527 | | | | |
| Total liabilities | \$ | 367,248,775 | | | | |
| PRESENT AND PROSPECTIVE AS | <u>SSETS</u> | | | | | |
| Actuarial value of assets | | \$ | 254,012,864 | | | |
| Present value of future contributions | | | | | | |
| City and member normal contributions | 101,536,859 | | | | | |
| Unfunded accrued liability contributions | 11,699,052 | | | | | |
| Total prospective contributions | | \$ | 113,235,911 | | | |
| Total assets | | <u>\$_</u> | <u>367,248,775</u> | | | |

.....

SOLVENCY TEST (\$ millions)

| | Aggreg | ate Accrued Lia | abilities For | | | ion of Acc Liabilities by Repor | \$ |
|-------------------|--|--|--|--------------------|------|---------------------------------------|-------|
| Valuation Date | (1) Active Member Contributions | (2) Retirants And Beneficiarie s | (3) Active Members (Employer Financed Portion) | Reported Assets | (1) | (2) | (3) |
| 7/1/02 | \$39.7 | \$130.5 | \$95.5 | \$254.0 | 100% | 100% | 87.7% |
| 7/1/01 | 37.7 | 121.1 | 96.0 | 246.6 | 100 | 100 | 91.5 |
| 7/1/00* | 34.0 | 123.8 | 82.0 | 235.9 | 100 | 100 | 95.2 |
| 7/1/99 | 32.3 | 87.9 | 66.7 | 216.3 | 100 | 100 | 100.0 |
| 7/1/98 | 31.1 | 79.6 | 68.7 | 187.4 | 100 | 100 | 100.0 |
| 7/1/97 | 29.4 | 73.6 | 65.1 | 161.7 | 100 | 100 | 90.2 |
| 7/1/96 | 28.1 | 68.3 | 64.8 | 142.9 | 100 | 100 | 71.7 |
| 7/1/95 | 26.1 | 63.7 | 61.9 | 129.0 | 100 | 100 | 63.4 |
| 7/1/94 | 24.8 | 59.3 | 58.7 | 117.4 | 100 | 100 | 56.8 |
| 7/1/93** | 22.3 | 59.5 | 54.8 | 109.7 | 100 | 100 | 51.0 |

All figures prior to July 1, 1999 are from July 1, 1998 actuarial report prepared by the prior actuary.

* Economic and demographic assumptions were changed as of July 1, 2000 due to an experience review. In addition, the asset valuation method was changed.

** Assumptions were changed beginning with the July 1, 1993 valuation to reflect recognition of unused sick and vacation time. The salary increase assumption was lowered from 6.0% to 5.0%.

SCHEDULE C

DEVELOPMENT OF THE ACTUARIAL VALUE OF ASSETS

| (1) | Actuarial Value of Assets as of July 1, 2001 | \$ | 246,613,781 |
|------|---|---|---|
| (2) | 2001/2002 Net Cash Flow (a) Contributions (b) Disbursements (c) Net Cash Flow (2)a - (2)b | | 10,176,000 14,232,000 (4,056,000) |
| (3) | Expected Investment Return [(1) x .0775] + [(2)c x .03875] | | 18,955,398 |
| (4) | Expected Actuarial Value of Assets as of July 1, 2002 (1) + (2)c + (3) | | 261,513,179 |
| (5) | Market Value of Assets as of July 1, 2002 | | 224,011,606 |
| (6) | Excess of Market Over Expected (5) – (4) | | (37,501,573) |
| (7) | 20% Adjustment Towards Market .20 x (6) | | (7,500,315) |
| (8) | Actuarial Value of Assets as of July 1, 2002 (4) + (7) | \$ | 254,012,864 |
| (9) | Rate of Return on Market Value | | (4.98%) |
| (10) | Rate of Return on Actuarial Value | | 4.68% |

SCHEDULE D

.....

Ħ

I

ASSET INFORMATION

| Investment Managers | Type of Investment | Percent Allocation |
|---|---|-----------------------|
| Evergreen Investment Management Co. LLC | Value Equity – Large Capitalization | 14.1% |
| Boston Partners | Value Equity – Mid Capitalization | 8.2 |
| Investment Counselors of Maryland | Value Equity – Small Capitalization | 4.4 |
| Alliance Capital Management | Growth Equity – Large Capitalization | 10.0 |
| Cadence Capital Management | Growth Equity – Mid Capitalization | 7.1 |
| Essex | Growth Equity – Small Capitalization | 1.4 |
| Morgan Stanley Dean Witter | International Equity Fund Emerging Markets Equity Fund | 13.9 1.2 |
| T. Rowe Price | International Equity Fund | 1.8 |
| Metropolitan Life | Real Estate Equity Fund | 4.1 |
| Banc of America Capital Management | Fixed Income | 12.5 |
| State Street Global Advisors | Fixed Income Index Fund | 14.0 |
| Baring Asset Management | International Fixed Income Fund Emerging Debt Fund | 5.3 0.5 |
| Internal Management | Money Market | 1.5 |

| | June 30, 2002 | June 30, 2001 | June 30, 2000 | |
|------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------|----------------|--|
| Cash Cash Equivalents | \$ (9,186,275) 15,066,403 | \$ | \$ | |
| Fixed Income Investments | 58,935,800 | 55,837,070 | 51,351,556 | |
| Equity Investments | 158,815,054 | 176,437,942 | 199,908,775 | |
| Other | 373,334 | 83,678 | 90,321 | |
| Accrued Income | 409,094 | 408,997 | 501,164 | |
| Accrued Contributions | 118,234 | 105,933 | 95,494 | |
| Accrued Liabilities/Expenses | (520,037) | <u>(404,413)</u> | (445,797) | |
| Total Market Value | \$ 224,011,606 | \$ 239,904,885 | \$ 260,213,127 | |

SCHEDULE E

OUTLINE OF ACTUARIAL ASSUMPTIONS AND METHODS

The assumptions and methods used in the valuation were selected by the Actuary and adopted by the Board April 27, 2000 unless otherwise indicated.

INVESTMENT RATE OF RETURN: 7.75% per year, compounded annually. (adopted 10-26-2000)

SALARY INCREASES: Representative values of the assumed annual rates of salary increases (adopted 10-26-2000) are as follows:

| <u>Age</u> | <u>Rate</u> * |
|------------|---------------|
| 20 | 7.75% |
| 25 | 7.75 |
| 30 | 7.75 |
| 35 | 7.25 |
| 40 | 6.25 |
| 45 | 4.75 |
| 50 | 4.75 |
| 55 | 4.75 |

* Includes inflation of 3.75%

SEPARATIONS FROM ACTIVE SERVICE: For death rates, the UP 1994 Male Table was used. Representative values of the assumed annual rates of separation from active service are as follows:

| <u>Age</u> | <u>Withdrawal</u> | Disability* | <u>Death</u> |
|--|---|---|---|
| 20 25 30 35 40 45 50 55 | 2.0% 2.0 2.0 2.0 1.7 0.8 | 0.05% 0.05 0.09 0.23 0.41 0.61 1.00 1.00 | .0006% .0007 .0009 .0009 .0012 .0017 .0028 .0048 |

* 65% of the disabilities are assumed to be in the line of duty.

| | Annual Rate o | of Retirement* | |
|------------|---------------|----------------|------|
| <u>Age</u> | Rate | Age | Rate |
| 50-54 | 20% | 60 | 20% |
| 55 | 20 | 61 | 20 |
| 56 | 20 | 62 | 20 |
| 57 | 20 | 63 | 20 |
| 58 | 20 | 64 | 20 |
| 59 | 20 | 65 | 100 |

* An additional 30% are assumed to retire at the age when first eligible for unreduced retirement and 100% are assumed to retire after completing 30 years of membership service.

DEATHS AFTER RETIREMENT: The UP 1994 Male Table is used for the period after retirement and for dependent beneficiaries. The same table is used for the period after disability set forward five years.

EXPENSES: 0.75% of payroll.

PERCENT MARRIED: 100% of active members are assumed to be married with the male three years older than his spouse.

ASSETS: Actuarial value, as developed in Schedule B. The actuarial value of assets recognizes a portion of the difference between the market value of assets and the expected actuarial value of assets, based on the assumed valuation rate of return. The amount recognized each year is 20% of the difference between market value and expected actuarial value. (adopted 10-26-2000)

VALUATION METHOD: Entry age actuarial cost method (adopted 7-1-98). See Schedule F for a brief description of this method.

SCHEDULE F

ACTUARIAL COST METHOD

- 1. The valuation is prepared on the projected benefit basis, under which the present value, at the interest rate assumed to be earned in the future (currently 7.75 per cent), of each member's expected benefits at retirement or death is determined, based on age, service and sex. The calculations take into account the probability of a member's death or termination of employment prior to becoming eligible for a benefit, as well as the possibility of his terminating with a service, disability or survivor's benefit. The present value of the expected benefits payable on account of the active members is added to the present value of the expected future payments to retired members and beneficiaries to obtain the present value of all expected benefits payable from the System on account of the present group of members and beneficiaries.
- The employer contributions required to support the benefits of the System are determined following a level funding approach, and consist of a normal contribution and an accrued liability contribution.
- 3. The normal contribution is determined using the entry age actuarial cost method. Under this method, a calculation is made to determine the level percentage of payroll which, if applied for the average new member during the entire period of his anticipated covered service, would be required in addition to the contributions of the member to meet the cost of all benefits payable on his behalf.
- 4. The unfunded accrued liability is determined by subtracting the present value of prospective employer normal contributions and member contributions, together with the current actuarial value of assets held, from the present value of expected benefits to be paid from the System.

SCHEDULE G

......

......

.

SUMMARY OF MAIN SYSTEM PROVISIONS AS INTERPRETED FOR VALUATION PURPOSES

| Member | An employee of the Charlotte Fire Department who is subject to the provisions of the Civil Service Act. |
|--|---|
| Membership Service Credit | Service for all periods of employment with the Charlotte Fire Department for which contributions have been paid. |
| Final Average Salary | A member's average monthly compensation for any 2 consecutive years within the last 5 years of membership service. |
| Accrued Benefit | The monthly amount of retirement benefits earned by a member as of any date computed on his Final Average Salary and Membership Service Credit at that date. |
| Service Retirement Benefit | |
| Eligibility | Age 50 and 25 years of membership service credit, age 60 and 5 years of membership service credit or 30 years of membership service credit. |
| Benefit | Monthly benefit is 2.6% of final average salary multiplied by years of membership service credit. Salary in the final year includes cashed-in vacation and sick days. The minimum monthly benefit is \$902.75. |
| Early Retirement Benefit | |
| Eligibility | 25 years of membership service credit. |
| Benefit | Accrued benefit reduced by 3% for each year member is under age 50. |
| In the Line of Duty Disability Retirement Benefit | |
| Eligibility | No requirements. |
| Benefit | 78% of final average salary or normal retirement benefit if greater. |
| Not in the Line of Duty Disability Retirement Benefit | |
| Eligibility | 10 years of service. |
| Benefit | 39% of final average salary plus 1.95% of such salary for each year of membership service credit in excess of 10 years, not less than \$902.75 per month. |

Deferred Vested Retirement Benefit

Eligibility

Benefit

Termination Benefit

Death Benefit

Optional Forms of Benefit

Contributions

5 years of service. Member contributions not withdrawn.

Accrued benefit payable at age 60. A member may choose a refund of contributions with 4% interest in lieu of this benefit.

If a member is terminated with less than 5 years of membership service credit, he is entitled to a return of his accumulated contributions.

If a member dies in service, his beneficiary is entitled to a return of the member's accumulated contributions, plus those contributions made by the City on his behalf, plus interest of 4% per year. May elect to receive actuarial equivalent monthly benefit under the 66-2/3% Joint and Survivor Option.

- (1) 10 year certain and life annuity.
- (2) 100%, 75%, 66-2/3% or 50% joint and survivorship annuity.
- (3) Joint and survivorship annuity with a pop-up provision.

The City and the members each contribute 12.65%.

Page 19

SCHEDULE H

1 Incomparison

and a second second

9.224 Managements

ŀ

.....

TABLE 1

AGE - SERVICE TABLE

Distribution of Active Members as of July 1, 2002 by Age and Service Groups

| Attained Age | | | | | Completed \ | fears of Serv | ice | | | |
|--------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-------------|---------------|-----------|----------|---------|------------|
| | 0 | 1 to 4 | 5 to 9 | 10 to 14 | 15 to 19 | 20 to 24 | 25 to 29 | 30 to 34 | > 35 | Total |
| 24 & under | 18 | 36 | | | | | | ł | | 5 |
| Total Pay | 533,094 | 1,187,297 | | | | ļ | | | | 1.720.39 |
| Avg. Pay | 29,616 | 32,980 | | | | | | | | 31,859 |
| 25 to 29 | 10 | 79 | 30 | 1 | | 1 | | | | 119 |
| Total Pay | 306,992 | 2,667,438 | 1,252,190 | | | | | | | 4.226.620 |
| Avg. Pay | 30,699 | 33,765 | 41,740 | | 1 | | | | | 35,518 |
| 30 to 34 | 5 | 59 | 67 | 35 | 3 | | - | | | 169 |
| Total Pay | 154,993 | 2,081,689 | 2,964,818 | 1,842,852 | 159,668 | | | | | 7,204,021 |
| Avg. Pay | 30,999 | 35,283 | 44,251 | 52,653 | 53,223 | | | | | 42.627 |
| 35 to 39 | 1 | 30 | 32 | 65 | 41 | 1 | 1 | | | 170 |
| Total Pay | 29,203 | 1,054,412 | 1,433,075 | 3,339,048 | 2,254,222 | 47,567 | | | | 8,157,527 |
| Avg. Pay | 29,203 | 35,147 | 44,784 | 51,370 | 54,981 | 47,567 | | | | 47,985 |
| 40 to 44 | | 4 | 15 | 41 | 89 | 12 | | | | 161 |
| Total Pay | | 137,487 | 655,394 | 2,045,991 | 4.821.041 | 677,434 | | | | 8,337,348 |
| Avg. Pay | | 34,372 | 43,693 | 49,902 | 54,169 | 56,453 | | | | 51,785 |
| 45 to 49 | | | 9 | 11 | 31 | 77 | 8 | | | 136 |
| Total Pay | | | 441,268 | 568,779 | 1,647,113 | 4,330,323 | 482,336 | | | 7,469,820 |
| Avg. Pay | | | 49,030 | 51,707 | 53,133 | 56,238 | 60,292 | | | 54,925 |
| 50 to 54 | | | | 4 | 2 | 20 | 11 | | | 37 |
| Total Pay | | | | 219,558 | 88,447 | 1,163,595 | 646,715 | | | 2,118,315 |
| Avg. Pay | | | | 54,890 | 44,224 | 58,180 | 58,792 | ľ | | 57,252 |
| 55 to 59 | | | | 2 | 2 | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 51,252 |
| Total Pay | | | | 86,291 | 88.447 | | 62,155 | 43,145 | 73,349 | 353.388 |
| Avg. Pay | | | | 43,145 | 44.224 | | 62,155 | 43,145 | 73,349 | 50,484 |
| 60 to 64 | | | | 1 | | | | 1 | 1 | 3 |
| Total Pay | | | | 43,145 | | | | 93,059 | 125.058 | 261,262 |
| Avg. Pay | | | | 43,145 | | | | 93,059 | 125,058 | 87,087 |
| Total | 34 | 208 | 153 | 159 | 168 | 110 | 20 | 2 | 123,030 | 856 |
| Total Pay | 1,024,281 | 7,128,324 | 6,746,745 | 8,145,665 | 9,058,939 | 6,218,920 | 1,191,206 | 136,204 | 198,407 | 39,848.691 |
| Avg. Pay | 30,126 | 34,271 | 44,096 | 51,231 | 53,922 | 56,536 | 59,560 | 68,102 | 99.204 | 46,552 |

TABLE 2

NUMBER OF RETIRED MEMBERS AND BENEFICIARIES AND THEIR BENEFITS BY AGE

| Attained <u>Age</u> | Number Of <u>Members</u> | Total Annual <u>Benefits</u> | Average Annual <u>Benefit</u> |
|------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 50 & Under | 17 | \$ 384,437 | \$ 22,614 |
| 51-55 | 95 | 3,512,425 | 36,973 |
| 56-60 | 89 | 3,141,377 | 35,296 |
| 61-65 | 61 | 2,442,688 | 40,044 |
| 66-70 [`] | 73 | 2,399,181 | 32,865 |
| 71-75 | 24 | 670,116 | 27.922 |
| 76-80 | 32 | 784,922 | 24,529 |
| Over 80 | _20 | 419,275 | 20,964 |
| Total | 411 | \$ 13,754,421 | \$ 33,466 |

TABLE 3

SCHEDULE OF ACTIVE MEMBER VALUATION DATA

| Valuation <u>Date</u> | Number Prior <u>Year</u> | <u>Exits</u> | New <u>Entrants</u> | Number Current <u>Year</u> | Annual Payroll | Annual Average <u>Pav</u> | % Increase in Average <u>Pay</u> |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------------|--|
| 7/1/02 | 853 | 31 | 34 | 856 | \$39.848.691 | \$46.552 | 4.3% |
| 7/1/01 | 780 | 15 | 88 | 853 | 38.079.024 | 44.641 | 5.3 |
| 7/1/00 | 783 | 35 | 32 | 780 | 33,079,899 | 42.410 | 2.3 |
| 7/1/99 | 778 | 31 | 36 | 783 | 32,462,456* | 41,459 | 11.4 |
| 7/1/98 | 749 | 30 | 59 | 778 | 28,963,868 | 37.229 | 3.6 |
| 7/1/97 | 721 | 29 | 57 | 749 | 26,922,035 | 35.944 | -0.6 |
| 7/1/96 | 709 | 25 | 37 | 721 | 26.072.828 | 36,162 | 3.7 |
| 7/1/95 | N/A | N/A | N/A | 709 | 24.723.956 | 34.872 | 4.7 |
| 7/1/94 | N/A | N/A | N/A | 724 | 24,120,362 | 33.315 | 2.4 |
| 7/1/93 | N/A | N/A | N/A | 721 | 23,448,153 | 32,522 | 0.0 |

Results prior to the 7/1/99 valuation were provided by the prior actuary.

Reflects all pay raises granted to firefighters effective July 7, 1999.

TABLE 4

SCHEDULE OF RETIRED MEMBERS AND BENEFICIARIES ADDED TO AND REMOVED FROM ROLLS

| Year Ended | Rolls – Beginning of Year | | Added to Rolls | | Removed from Rolls | | Rolls – End of Year | | | |
|---------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|--|--|
| | <u>No.</u> | Annual <u>Allowances</u> | <u>No.</u> | Annual <u>Allowances</u> | <u>No.</u> | Annual <u>Allowances</u> | <u>No.</u> | Annual <u>Allowances</u> | % Increase in Annual <u>Allowances</u> | Average Annuaí <u>Allowances</u> |
| 7/1/02 | 389 | \$12,824,893 | 29 | \$1,202,320 | 7 | \$273.092 | 411 | \$13,754,121 | 7.2 | \$33,466 |
| 7/1/01 | 394 | 13,000,973** | 11 | 287,966 | 16 | 464,046 | 389 | 12,824,893 | (1.4) | 32,969 |
| 7/1/00 | 377 | 9,946,747* | 28 | 3,260,650** | 11 | 206,424 | 394 | 13,000,973** | 30.7 | 32,997 |
| 7/1/99 | 358 | 8,882,634 | 26 | 950,857 | 7 | 119.640 | 377 | 9,946,747* | 12.0 | 26.384 |
| 7/1/98 | 337 | 8,199,997 | 24 | 762,314 | 3 | 79.677 | 358 | 8,882,634 | 8.3 | 24,812 |
| 7/1/97 | 321 | 7,602,561 | 22 | 698,791 | 6 | 101,335 | 337 | 8,199,997 | 7.9 | 24,332 |
| 7/1/96 | 307 | 7,046,272 | 19 | 616,589 | 5 | 60,300 | 321 | 7,602,561 | 7.9 | 23,684 |
| 7/1/95 | 298 | 6,552,767 | 18 | 613,085 | 9 | 119,580 | 307 | 7,046,272 | 7.5 | 22,952 |
| 7/1/94 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | 298 | 6,552,767 | 0.4 | 21,989 |
| 7/1/93 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | 301 | 6,524,697 | 30.1 | 21,505 |

Results prior to the 7/1/99 valuation were provided by the prior actuary.

Includes 8.33% benefit adjustment effective July 1, 1998 for members retired prior to July 1, 1989. Includes ad hoc benefit adjustments granted since the previous valuation. * **